# Modelling word analogies with language models 

Steven Schockaert

School of Computer Science \& Informatics
Cardiff University, Cardiff, UK
SchockaertS1@cardiff.ac.uk
http://users.cs.cf.ac.uk/S.Schockaert
UNIVERSITY

## Word vectors and analogies


T. Mikolov. Distributed representations of words and phrases and their compositionality. NIPS 2013

## Why do vector differences model analogies?

Typical context words of "France": arrondissement, renaissance, ...

Typical context words of "capital": embassy, palace, ...

Typical context words of "Paris": arrondissement, embassy, palace, ...

## Why do vector differences model analogies?

Typical context words of France: arrondissement, renaissance, ...

Typical context words of capital cities: embassy, palace, ...

Typical context words of Paris: arrondissement, embassy, palace, ...

## Why do vector differences model analogies?



## Why do vector differences model analogies?



## Abstract analogies

| Query: |  | word:language $)$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Candidates: | (1) | paint:portrait |
|  | (2) | poetry:rhythm |
|  | (3) | note:music |
|  | (4) | tale:story |
|  | (5) | week:year |

## Abstract analogies

| Query: |  | word:language |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Candidates: | (1) | paint:portrait |
|  | $(2)$ | poetry:rhythm |
|  | $\mathbf{( 3 )}$ | note:music |
|  | $(4)$ | tale:story |
|  | $(5)$ | week:year |

## Accuracy

- FastText: 49.7
- GloVe: 48.9
- Word2Vec: 42.8
- Latent Relational Analysis: 56.4


## Contextualised Language Models



## Contextualised Language Models



## Contextualised Language Models



Jacob Devlin, Ming-Wei Chang, Kenton Lee, Kristina Toutanova: BERT: Pre-training of Deep Bidirectional Transformers for Language Understanding. NAACL-HLT 2019: 4171-4186

## Language Models as Knowledge Bases

Paris

manually constructed prompt

Fabio Petroni, Tim Rocktäschel, Sebastian Riedel, Patrick S. H. Lewis, Anton Bakhtin, Yuxiang Wu, Alexander H. Miller: Language Models as Knowledge Bases? EMNLP/IJCNLP (1) 2019: 2463-2473

## Prompt Engineering



Taylor Shin, Yasaman Razeghi, Robert L. Logan IV, Eric Wallace, Sameer Singh: AutoPrompt: Eliciting Knowledge from Language Models with Automatically Generated Prompts. EMNLP (1) 2020: 4222-4235

# BERT is to NLP what AlexNet is to CV: <br> Can Pre-Trained Language Models Identify Analogies? 

Asahi Ushio, Luis Espinosa-Anke, Steven Schockaert, Jose Camacho-Collados
Cardiff NLP, School of Computer Science and Informatics
Cardiff University, United Kingdom
\{UshioA, Espinosa-AnkeL,SchockaertS1, CamachoColladosJ\}@cardiff.ac.uk

Can language models recognise analogies?


Word is to language what note is to music

## Scoring functions: perplexity

How "fluent" are the following sentences:
word is to language what paint is to portrait word is to language what poetry is to rhythm word is to language what note is to music word is to language what tale is to story word is to language what week is to year

$$
\exp \left(-\sum_{j=1}^{m} \log P\left(x_{j} \mid x_{j-1}\right)\right)
$$

## Scoring functions: PMI-based

How much more likely is "music" as the prediction in:
word is to language what note is to [MASK]
compared to:
word is to language what [MASK] is to [MASK]

$$
\log P\left(t_{i} \mid h_{i}, h_{q}, t_{q}\right)-\alpha \log P\left(t_{i} \mid h_{q}, t_{q}\right)
$$

## Scoring functions: PMI-based

Compare the probability of the joint prediction (note,music) in: word is to language what [MASK] is to [MASK]
to the probabilities of the individual predictions of note and music, respectively in:
word is to language what [MASK] is to [MASK]
word is to language what [MASK] is to [MASK]
$\log P\left(t_{i}, h_{i} \mid h_{q}, t_{q}\right)-\alpha_{t} \log P\left(t_{i} \mid h_{q}, t_{q}\right)-\alpha_{h} \log P\left(h_{i} \mid h_{q}, t_{q}\right)$

## Results

## Automatically learned prompt, optimised scoring function



Results
abstract
analogies

|  | Model | Score | Tuned | SAT | U2 | U4 | Google BATS |  | $\frac{\text { Avg }}{48.4}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| BERT |  | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 32.9 | 32.9 | 34.0 | 80.8 | 61.5 |  |
|  |  | $\checkmark$ | 39.8 | 41.7 | 41.0 | 86.8 | 67.9 | 55.4 |  |
|  |  |  |  | 27.0 | 32.0 | 31.2 | 74.0 | 59.1 | 44.7 |
|  |  | $s_{\text {PMI }}$ | $\checkmark$ | 40.4 | 42.5 | 27.8 | 87.0 | 68.1 | 53.2 |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 41.8 | 44.7 | 41.2 | 88.8 | 67.9 | 56.9 |
| $\sum$ | GPT-2 |  | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 35.9 | 41.2 | 44.9 | 80.4 | 63.5 | 53.2 |
|  |  | $\checkmark$ |  | 50.4 | 48.7 | 51.2 | 93.2 | 75.9 | 63.9 |
|  |  | $s_{P M I}$ |  | 34.4 | 44.7 | 43.3 | 62.8 | 62.8 | 49.6 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 51.0 | 37.7 | 50.5 | 91.0 | 79.8 | 62.0 |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 56.7 | 50.9 | 49.5 | 95.2 | 81.2 | 66.7 |
|  | RoBERTa | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 42.4 | 49.1 | 49.1 | 90.8 | 69.7 | 60.2 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 53.7 | 57.0 | 55.8 | 93.6 | 80.5 | 68.1 |
|  |  | $s_{\text {PMI }}$ |  | 35.9 | 42.5 | 44.0 | 60.8 | 60.8 | $48.8$ |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 51.3 | 49.1 | 38.7 | 92.4 | 77.2 | $61.7$ |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 53.4 | 58.3 | 57.4 | 93.6 | 78.4 | 68.2 |
| $\frac{11}{3}$ |  | L |  |  | 43.0 | 40.7 | 96.6 | 72.0 | 60.0 |
|  | GloVe | - |  | 47.8 | 46.5 | 39.8 | 96.0 | 68.7 | 59.8 |
|  | Word2vec | - |  | 41.8 | 40.4 | 39.6 | 93.2 | 63.8 | 55.8 |
| $\begin{aligned} & \ddot{\ddot{\omega}} \\ & \tilde{\omega} \end{aligned}$ | PMI | - |  | 23.3 | 32.9 | 39.1 | 57.4 | 42.7 | 39.1 |
|  | Random | - |  | 20.0 | 23.6 | 24.2 | 25.0 | 25.0 | 23.6 |

## Results

|  | Model | Score | Tuned | SAT | U2 | U4 | Google BATS |  | Avg |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| BERT |  | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 32.9 | 32.9 | 34.0 | 80.8 | 61.5 | 48.4 |
|  |  | $\checkmark$ | 39.8 | 41.7 | 41.0 | 86.8 | 67.9 | 55.4 |
|  |  | $s_{P M I}$ |  | 27.0 | 32.0 | 31.2 | 74.0 | 59.1 | 44.7 |
|  |  | $\checkmark$ | 40.4 | 42.5 | 27.8 | 87.0 | 68.1 | 53.2 |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 41.8 | 44.7 | 41.2 | 88.8 | 67.9 | 56.9 |
| $\sum$ | GPT-2 |  | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 35.9 | 41.2 | 44.9 | 80.4 | 63.5 | 53.2 |
|  |  | $\checkmark$ |  | 50.4 | 48.7 | 51.2 | 93.2 | 75.9 | 63.9 |
|  |  | $s_{\text {PMI }}$ |  | 34.4 | 44.7 | 43.3 | 62.8 | 62.8 | 49.6 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 51.0 | 37.7 | 50.5 | 91.0 | 79.8 | 62.0 |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 56.7 | 50.9 | 49.5 | 95.2 | 81.2 | 66.7 |
|  | RoBERTa | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 42.4 | 49.1 | 49.1 | 90.8 | 69.7 | 60.2 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 53.7 | 57.0 | 55.8 | 93.6 | 80.5 | 68.1 |
|  |  | $s_{\text {PMI }}$ |  | 35.9 | 42.5 | 44.0 | 60.8 | 60.8 | 48.8 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 51.3 | 49.1 | 38.7 | 92.4 | 77.2 | 61.7 |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 53.4 | 58.3 | 57.4 | 93.6 | 78.4 | 68.2 |
| $\frac{1}{3}$ | FastText | - |  | 47.8 | 43.0 | 40.7 | 96.6 | 72.0 | 60.0 |
|  | GloVe | - |  | 47.8 | 46.5 | 39.8 | 96.0 | 68.7 | 59.8 |
|  | Word2vec | - |  | 41.8 | 40.4 | 39.6 | 93.2 | 63.8 | 55.8 |
| $\begin{aligned} & \hline \ddot{\sim} \\ & \stackrel{\sim}{\sim} \end{aligned}$ | PMI | - |  | 23.3 | 32.9 | 39.1 | 57.4 | 42.7 | 39.1 |
|  | Random | - |  | 20.0 | 23.6 | 24.2 | 25.0 | 25.0 | 23.6 |

## Results

|  | Model | Score | Tuned | SAT | U2 | U4 | Google | BATS | Avg |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\sum$ | BERT | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 32.9 | 32.9 | 34.0 | 80.8 | 61.5 | 48.4 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 39.8 | 41.7 | 41.0 | 86.8 | 67.9 | 55.4 |
|  |  | $s_{P M I}$ |  | 27.0 | 32.0 | 31.2 | 74.0 | 59.1 | 44.7 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 40.4 | 42.5 | 27.8 | 87.0 | 68.1 | 53.2 |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 41.8 | 44.7 | 41.2 | 88.8 | 67.9 | 56.9 |
|  | GPT-2 | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 35.9 | 41.2 | 44.9 | 80.4 | 63.5 | 53.2 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 50.4 | 48.7 | 51.2 | 93.2 | 75.9 | 63.9 |
|  |  | $s_{\text {PMI }}$ |  | 34.4 | 44.7 | 43.3 | 62.8 | 62.8 | 49.6 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 51.0 | 37.7 | 50.5 | 91.0 | 79.8 | 62.0 |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 56.7 | 50.9 | 49.5 | 95.2 | 81.2 | 66.7 |
|  | RoBERTa | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 42.4 | 49.1 | 49.1 | 90.8 | 69.7 | 60.2 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 53.7 | 57.0 | 55.8 | 93.6 | 80.5 | 68.1 |
|  |  | $s_{\text {PMI }}$ |  | 35.9 | 42.5 | 44.0 | 60.8 | 60.8 | 48.8 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 51.3 | 49.1 | 38.7 | 92.4 | 77.2 | 61.7 |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 53.4 | 58.3 | 57.4 | 93.6 | 78.4 | 68.2 |
| $\sum_{3}^{N}$ | FastText | - |  | 47.8 | 43.0 | 40.7 | 96.6 | 72.0 | 60.0 |
|  | GloVe | - |  | 47.8 | 46.5 | 39.8 | 96.0 | 68.7 | 59.8 |
|  | Word2vec | - |  | 41.8 | 40.4 | 39.6 | 93.2 | 63.8 | 55.8 |
| $\begin{aligned} & \dot{\sim} \\ & \underset{\sim}{\sim} \end{aligned}$ | PMI | - |  | 23.3 | 32.9 | 39.1 | 57.4 | 42.7 | 39.1 |
|  | Random | - |  | 20.0 | 23.6 | 24.2 | 25.0 | 25.0 | 23.6 |

## Results

|  | Model | Score | Tuned | Accuracy |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| LM | BERT | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 32.6 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 40.4* |
|  |  | $s_{\text {PMI }}$ |  | 26.8 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 41.2* |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 42.8* |
|  | GPT-2 | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 41.4 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 56.2* |
|  |  | $s_{\text {PMI }}$ |  | 34.7 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 56.8* |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 57.8* |
|  | RoBERTa | $s_{P P L}$ |  | 49.6 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 55.8* |
|  |  | $s_{P M I}$ |  | 42.5 |
|  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | 54.0* |
|  |  | $s_{m P P L}$ | $\checkmark$ | 55.8* |
|  | GPT-3 | Zero-shot |  | 53.7 |
|  |  | Few-shot | $\checkmark$ | 65.2* |
| - | LRA | - |  | 56.4 |
| WE | FastText | - |  | 49.7 |
|  | GloVe | - |  | 48.9 |
|  | Word2vec | - |  | 42.8 |
| Base | PMI | - |  | 23.3 |
|  | Random | - |  | 20.0 |

## Easier for humans = easier for LMs?



high-beginning low-intermediate
high-intermediate low-advanced
high-advanced

## Are the results robust under permutations?



## Are the results robust under permutations?



# Distilling Relation Embeddings from Pre-trained Language Models 

Asahi Ushio and Jose Camacho-Collados and Steven Schockaert
Cardiff NLP, School of Computer Science and Informatics
Cardiff University, United Kingdom
\{UshioA, CamachoColladosJ, SchockaertS1\}@cardiff.ac.uk

## Learning relation vectors

## relation vector



Fabio Petroni, Tim Rocktäschel, Sebastian Riedel, Patrick S. H. Lewis, Anton Bakhtin, Yuxiang Wu, Alexander H. Miller: Language Models as Knowledge Bases? EMNLP/IJCNLP (1) 2019: 2463-2473

## Fine-tune BERT on SemEval-2012 Task 2 data

| Subcategory | Relation name | Relation schema | Paradigms | Responses |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 8(e) | AGENT:GOAL | " $Y$ is the goal of $X "$ | pilgrim:shrine <br> assassin:death <br> climber:peak | patient:health <br> runner:finish <br> astronaut:space |
| 5(e) | OBJECT:TYPICAL ACTION | "an $X$ will typically $Y "$ | glass:break <br> soldier:fight | ice:melt <br> lion:roar |
|  |  |  | juggernaut:crush | knife:stab |

## Fine-tune BERT on SemEval-2012 Task 2 data

66.0 "fire:hot"<br>59.6 "villain:evil"<br>53.8 "water:wet"<br>43.1 "tycoon:wealthy"<br>42.3 "snow:cold"<br>35.3 "candy:sweet"<br>32.0 "professor:intellectual"<br>30.0 "steel:strong"<br>30.0 "novice:inexperience"<br>-45.1 "prince:charming"<br>-46.0 "heat:fire"<br>-52.0 "lipstick:red"<br>-56.9 "fizzy:pop"<br>-60.0 "man:tall"<br>-72.5 "flimsy:paper"<br>-72.5 "tall:man"<br>-76.5 "intellectual:professor"

56.0 "loss:grief"
48.0 "injury:pain"
44.0 "disease:sickness"
42.0 "explosion:damage"
41.2 "accident:damage"
34.5 "germs:sickness"
30.0 "bath:cleanliness"
26.0 "exercise:fitness"
22.0 "tragedy:tears"
-22.0 "digging:hole"
-24.0 "sow:germinate"
-28.0 "yelling:anger"
-42.0 "headache:stress"
-48.0 "learning:study"
-62.0 "response:stimulus"
-66.0 "boredom:repetition"
-74.0 "sweat:run"

## Fine-tune BERT on SemEval-2012 Task 2 data

should be similar

66.0 "fire:hot"<br>59.6 "villain:evil"<br>53.8 "water:wet"<br>43.1 "tycoon:wealthy"<br>42.3 "snow:cold"<br>35.3 "candy:sweet"<br>32.0 "professor:intellectual"<br>30.0 "steel:strong"<br>30.0 "novice:inexperience"<br>-45.1 "prince:charming"<br>-46.0 "heat:fire"<br>-52.0 "lipstick:red"<br>-56.9 "fizzy:pop"<br>-60.0 "man:tall"<br>-72.5 "flimsy:paper"<br>-72.5 "tall:man"<br>-76.5 "intellectual:professor"

56.0 "loss:grief"
48.0 "injury:pain"
44.0 "disease:sickness"
42.0 "explosion:damage"
41.2 "accident:damage"
34.5 "germs:sickness"
30.0 "bath:cleanliness"
26.0 "exercise:fitness"
22.0 "tragedy:tears"
-22.0 "digging:hole"
-24.0 "sow:germinate"
-28.0 "yelling:anger"
-42.0 "headache:stress"
-48.0 "learning:study"
-62.0 "response:stimulus"
-66.0 "boredom:repetition"
-74.0 "sweat:run"

## Fine-tune BERT on SemEval-2012 Task 2 data

should be dissimilar
66.0 "fire:hot"
59.6 "villain:evil"
53.8 "water:wet"
43.1 "tycoon:wealthy"
42.3 "snow:cold"
35.3 "candy:sweet"
32.0 "professor:intellectual"
30.0 "steel:strong"
30.0 "novice:inexperience"
...
-45.1 "prince:charming"
-46.0 "heat:fire"
-52.0 "lipstick:red"
-56.9 "fizzy:pop"
-60.0 "man:tall"
-72.5 "flimsy:paper"
-72.5 "tall:man"
-76.5 "intellectual:professor"
56.0 "loss:grief"
48.0 "injury:pain"
44.0 "disease:sickness"
42.0 "explosion:damage"
41.2 "accident:damage"
34.5 "germs:sickness"
30.0 "bath:cleanliness"
26.0 "exercise:fitness"
22.0 "tragedy:tears"
-22.0 "digging:hole"
-24.0 "sow:germinate"
-28.0 "yelling:anger"
-42.0 "headache:stress"
-48.0 "learning:study"
-62.0 "response:stimulus"
-66.0 "boredom:repetition"
-74.0 "sweat:run"

## Fine-tune BERT on SemEval-2012 Task 2 data

## should be dissimilar

66.0 "fire:hot"
59.6 "villain:evil"
53.8 "water:wet"
43.1 "tycoon:wealthy"
42.3 "snow:cold"
35.3 "candy:sweet"
32.0 "professor:intellectual"
30.0 "steel:strong"
30.0 "novice:inexperience"
-45.1 "prince:charming"
-46.0 "heat:fire"
-52.0 "lipstick:red"
-56.9 "fizzy:pop"
-60.0 "man:tall"
-72.5 "flimsy:paper"
-72.5 "tall:man"
-76.5 "intellectual:professor"
56.0 "loss:grief"
48.0 "injury:pain"
44.0 "disease:sickness"
42.0 "explosion:damage"
41.2 "accident:damage"
34.5 "germs:sickness"
30.0 "bath:cleanliness"
26.0 "exercise:fitness"
22.0 "tragedy:tears"
-22.0 "digging:hole"
-24.0 "sow:germinate"
-28.0 "yelling:anger"
-42.0 "headache:stress"
-48.0 "learning:study"
-62.0 "response:stimulus"
-66.0 "boredom:repetition"
-74.0 "sweat:run"

## Training loss

## Triplet loss

$$
L_{t}=\max \left(0,\left\|\boldsymbol{x}_{a}-\boldsymbol{x}_{p}\right\|-\left\|\boldsymbol{x}_{a}-\boldsymbol{x}_{n}\right\|+\varepsilon\right)
$$

## relation vector for some word pair a

 relation vector for a word pair p , similar to a relation vector for a word pair n, not similar to aDavid Jurgens, Saif Mohammad, Peter D. Turney, Keith J. Holyoak: SemEval-2012 Task 2: Measuring Degrees of Relational Similarity. SemEval@NAACL-HLT 2012: 356-364

## Training loss

## Triplet loss

$$
L_{t}=\max \left(0,\left\|\boldsymbol{x}_{a}-\boldsymbol{x}_{p}\right\|-\left\|\boldsymbol{x}_{a}-\boldsymbol{x}_{n}\right\|+\varepsilon\right)
$$

## Classification loss

$$
\begin{aligned}
L_{c} & =-\log \left(g\left(\boldsymbol{x}_{a}, \boldsymbol{x}_{p}\right)\right)-\log \left(1-g\left(\boldsymbol{x}_{a}, \boldsymbol{x}_{n}\right)\right) \\
g(\boldsymbol{u}, \boldsymbol{v}) & =\operatorname{sigmoid}\left(W \cdot[\boldsymbol{u} \oplus \boldsymbol{v} \oplus|\boldsymbol{v}-\boldsymbol{u}|]^{T}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

David Jurgens, Saif Mohammad, Peter D. Turney, Keith J. Holyoak: SemEval-2012 Task 2: Measuring Degrees of Relational Similarity. SemEval@NAACL-HLT 2012: 356-364

## Results

| Model | SAT $\dagger$ | SAT | U2 | U4 | Google BATS |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Random | 20.0 | 20.0 | 23.6 | 24.2 | 25.0 | 25.0 |
| PMI | 23.3 | 23.1 | 32.9 | 39.1 | 57.4 | 42.7 |
| LRA | 56.4 | - | - | - | - | - |
| SuperSim | 54.8 | - | - | - | - | - |
| GPT-3 (zero) | 53.7 | - | - | - | - | - |
| GPT-3 (few) | 65.2* | - | - | - | - | - |
| RELATIVE | 24.9 | 24.6 | 32.5 | 27.1 | 62.0 | 39.0 |
| pair2vec | 33.7 | 34.1 | 25.4 | 28.2 | 66.6 | 53.8 |
| GloVe | 48.9 | 47.8 | 46.5 | 39.8 | 96.0 | 68.7 |
| FastText | 49.7 | 47.8 | 43.0 | 40.7 | 96.6 | 72.0 |
| Analogical Proportion Score |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| - GPT-2 | 41.4 | 35.9 | 41.2 | 44.9 | 80.4 | 63.5 |
| - BERT | 32.6 | 32.9 | 32.9 | 34.0 | 80.8 | 61.5 |
| - RoBERTa | 49.6 | 42.4 | 49.1 | 49.1 | 90.8 | 69.7 |
| Analogical Proportion Score (tuned) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| - GPT-2 | 57.8* | 56.7* | 50.9* | 49.5* | 95.2* | 81.2* |
| - BERT | 42.8* | 41.8* | 44.7* | 41.2* | 88.8* | 67.9* |
| - RoBERTa | 55.8* | 53.4* | 58.3* | 57.4* | 93.6* | 78.4* |
| RelBERT |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| - Manual | 69.5 | 70.6 | 66.2 | 65.3 | 92.4 | 78.8 |
| - AutoPrompt | 61.0 | 62.3 | 61.4 | 63.0 | 88.2 | 74.6 |
| - P-tuning | 54.0 | 55.5 | 58.3 | 55.8 | 83.4 | 72.1 |

Results

|  | Model | BLESS |  | CogALexV |  | EVALution |  | $\mathbf{K} \boldsymbol{\&} \mathbf{H}+\mathbf{N}$ |  | ROOT09 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | macro | micro | macro | micro | macro | micro | macro | micro | macro | micro |
| GloVe | cat | 92.9 | 93.3 | 42.8 | 73.5 | 56.9 | 58.3 | 88.8 | 94.9 | 86.3 | 86.5 |
|  | cat + dot | 93.1 | 93.7 | 51.9 | 79.2 | 55.9 | 57.3 | 89.6 | 95.1 | 88.8 | 89.0 |
|  | cat + dot + pair | 91.8 | 92.6 | 56.4 | 81.1 | 58.1 | 59.6 | 89.4 | 95.7 | 89.2 | 89.4 |
|  | cat + dot+rel | 91.1 | 92.0 | 53.2 | 79.2 | 58.4 | 58.6 | 89.3 | 94.9 | 89.3 | 89.4 |
|  | diff | 91.0 | 91.5 | 39.2 | 70.8 | 55.6 | 56.9 | 87.0 | 94.4 | 85.9 | 86.3 |
|  | diff + dot | 92.3 | 92.9 | 50.6 | 78.5 | 56.5 | 57.9 | 88.3 | 94.8 | 88.6 | 88.9 |
|  | diff+dot+pair | 91.3 | 92.2 | 55.5 | 80.2 | 56.0 | 57.4 | 88.0 | 95.5 | 89.1 | 89.4 |
|  | diff + dot + rel | 91.1 | 91.8 | 52.8 | 78.6 | 56.9 | 57.9 | 87.4 | 94.6 | 87.7 | 88.1 |
| FastText | cat | 92.4 | 92.9 | 40.7 | 72.4 | 56.4 | 57.9 | 88.1 | 93.8 | 85.7 | 85.5 |
|  | cat + dot | 92.7 | 93.2 | 48.5 | 77.4 | 56.7 | 57.8 | 89.1 | 94.0 | 88.2 | 88.5 |
|  | cat + dot+pair | 90.9 | 91.5 | 53.0 | 79.3 | 56.1 | 58.2 | 88.3 | 94.3 | 87.7 | 87.8 |
|  | cat + dot + rel | 91.4 | 91.9 | 50.6 | 76.8 | 57.9 | 59.1 | 86.9 | 93.5 | 87.1 | 87.4 |
|  | diff | 90.7 | 91.2 | 39.7 | 70.2 | 53.2 | 55.5 | 85.8 | 93.3 | 85.5 | 86.0 |
|  | diff + dot | 92.3 | 92.9 | 49.1 | 77.8 | 55.2 | 57.4 | 86.5 | 93.6 | 88.5 | 88.9 |
|  | diff+dot+pair | 90.0 | 90.8 | 53.9 | 79.0 | 55.8 | 57.8 | 86.6 | 94.2 | 87.7 | 88.1 |
|  | diff + dot + rel | 90.6 | 91.3 | 53.6 | 78.2 | 57.1 | 58.0 | 86.3 | 93.4 | 86.9 | 87.4 |
| RelBERT | Manual | 91.7 | 92.1 | 71.2 | 87.0 | 68.4 | 69.6 | 88.0 | 96.2 | 90.9 | 91.0 |
|  | AutoPrompt | 91.9 | 92.4 | 68.5 | 85.1 | 69.5 | 70.5 | 91.3 | 97.1 | 90.0 | 90.3 |
|  | P-tuning | 91.3 | 91.8 | 67.8 | 84.9 | 69.1 | 70.2 | 88.5 | 96.3 | 89.8 | 89.9 |
| SotA | LexNET | - | 89.3 | - | - | - | 60.0 | - | 98.5 | - | 81.3 |
|  | SphereRE | - | 93.8 | - | - | - | 62.0 | - | 99.0 | - | 86.1 |

## Results

|  | BLESS | CogALex | EVAL | K\&H+N | ROOT09 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| rand | $93.7(+0.3)$ | $94.3(-0.2)$ | - | $97.9(+0.2)$ | $91.2(-0.1)$ |
| mero | $89.8(+1.4)$ | $72.9(+2.7)$ | $69.2(+1.9)$ | $74.5(+5.4)$ | - |
| event | $86.5(-0.3)$ | - | - | - | - |
| hyp | $94.1(+0.8)$ | $60.9(-0.7)$ | $61.7(-1.5)$ | $93.5(+5.0)$ | $83.0(-0.4)$ |
| cohyp | $96.4(+0.3)$ | - | - | $97.8(+1.2)$ | $97.4(-0.5)$ |
| attr | $92.6(+0.3)$ | - | $84.7(+1.6)$ | - | - |
| poss | - | - | $67.1(-0.2)$ | - | - |
| ant | - | $76.8(-2.6)$ | $81.3(-0.9)$ | - | - |
| syn | - | $49.9(-0.6)$ | $53.6(+2.7)$ | - | - |
| macro | $92.2(+0.5)$ | $71.0(-0.2)$ | $69.3(+0.9)$ | $90.9(+2.9)$ | $90.5(-0.4)$ |
| micro | $92.5(+0.4)$ | $86.9(-0.1)$ | $70.2(+0.6)$ | $97.2(+1.0)$ | $90.7(-0.3)$ |

## Examples

| Category | Target | Nearest Neighbors RelBERT |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Commonsense | barista:coffee <br> restaurant:waitress <br> car:garage <br> ice:melt <br> dolphin:swim <br> flower:fragrant <br> coconut:milk <br> bag:plastic <br> duck:duckling | baker:bread, brewer:beer, bartender:cocktail, winemaker:wine, bartender:drink, baker:cake restaurant:waiter, diner:waitress, bar:bartender, hospital:nurse, courthouse:clerk, office:clerk car:pit, plane:hangar, auto:garage, baby:crib, yacht:harbour, aircraft:hangar snow:melt, glacier:melt, ice:drift, crust:melt, polar ice:melt, ice:thaw squid:swim, salmon:swim, shark:swim, fish:swim, horse:run, frog:leap orchid:fragrant, cluster:fragrant, jewel:precious, jewel:valuable, soil:permeable, vegetation:abundant coconut:oil, goat:milk, grape:juice, palm:oil, olive:oil, camel:milk bottle:plastic, bag:leather, container:plastic, box:plastic, jug:glass, bottle:glass chicken:chick, pig:piglet, cat:kitten, ox:calf, butterfly:larvae, bear:cub |
| Gender | man:woman | men:women, male:female, father:mother, boy:girl, hero:heroine, king:queen |
| Antonymy | cooked:raw normal:abnormal | raw:cooked, regulated:unregulated, sober:drunk, loaded:unloaded, armed:unarmed, published:unpublished ordinary:unusual, usual:unusual, acceptable:unacceptable, stable:unstable, rational:irrational, legal:illegal |
| Meronymy | helicopter:rotor bat:wing beer:alcohol oxygen:atmosphere | helicopter:rotor blades, helicopter:wing, bicycle:wheel, motorcycle:wheel, airplane:engine, plane:engine butterfly:wing, eagle:wing, angel:wing, cat:paw, lion:wings, fly:wing wine:alcohol, cider:alcohol, soda:sugar, beer:liquor, beer:malt, lager:alcoho helium:atmosphere, hydrogen:atmosphere, nitrogen:atmosphere, methane:atmosphere, carbon:atmosphere |
| Hypernymy | chihuahua:dog pelican:bird tennis:sport | dachshund:dog, poodle:dog, terrier:dog, chinchilla:rodent, macaque:monkey, dalmatian:dog toucan:bird, puffin:bird, egret:bird, peacock:bird, grouse:bird, pigeon:bird hockey:sport, soccer:sport, volleyball:sport, cricket:sport, golf:sport, football:sport |
| Morphology | dog:dogs tall:tallest spy:espionage | cat:cats, horse:horses, pig:pigs, rat:rats, wolf:wolves, monkey:monkeys strong:strongest, short:shortest, smart:smartest, weak:weakest, big:biggest, small:smallest pirate:piracy, robber:robbery, lobbyist:lobbying, scout:scouting, terrorist:terrorism, witch:witchcraft |

## Examples

| Category | Target | Nearest Neighbors RelBERT |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | barista:coffee | baker:bread, brewer:beer, bartender:cocktail, winemaker:wine, bartender:drink, baker:cake |
|  | restaurant:waitress | restaurant:waiter, diner:waitress, bar:bartender, hospital:nurse, courthouse:clerk, office:clerk |
|  | car:garage ice:melt | car:pit, plane:hangar, auto:garage, baby:crib, yacht:harbour, aircraft:hangar snow:melt, glacier:melt, ice:drift, crust:melt, polar ice:melt, ice:thaw |
| Commonsense | dolphin:swim | squid:swim, salmon:swim, shark:swim, fish:swim, horse:run, frog:leap |
|  | flower:fragrant coconut:milk | orchid:fragrant, cluster:fragrant, jewel:precious, jewel:valuable, soil:permeable, vegetation:abundant coconut:oil, goat:milk, grape:juice, palm:oil, olive:oil, camel:milk |
|  | bag:plastic duck:ducklin | bottle:plastic, bag:leather, container:plastic, box:plastic, jug:glass, bottle:glass |
| Gender | man:woman | men:women, male:female, father:mother, boy:girl, hero:heroine, king:queen |
| Antonymy | cooked:raw normal:abnormal | raw:cooked, regulated:unregulated, sober:drunk, loaded:unloaded, armed:unarmed, published:unpublished ordinary:unusual, usual:unusual, acceptable:unacceptable, stable:unstable, rational:irrational, legal:illegal |
| Meronymy | helicopter:rotor <br> bat:wing <br> beer:alcohol <br> oxygen:atmosphere | helicopter:rotor blades, helicopter:wing, bicycle:wheel, motorcycle:wheel, airplane:engine, plane:engine butterfly:wing, eagle:wing, angel:wing, cat:paw, lion:wings, fly:wing wine:alcohol, cider:alcohol, soda:sugar, beer:liquor, beer:malt, lager:alcoho helium:atmosphere, hydrogen:atmosphere, nitrogen:atmosphere, methane:atmosphere, carbon:atmosphere |
| Hypernymy | chihuahua:dog pelican:bird tennis:sport | dachshund:dog, poodle:dog, terrier:dog, chinchilla:rodent, macaque:monkey, dalmatian:dog toucan:bird, puffin:bird, egret:bird, peacock:bird, grouse:bird, pigeon:bird hockey:sport, soccer:sport, volleyball:sport, cricket:sport, golf:sport, football:sport |
| Morphology | dog:dogs tall:tallest spy:espionage | cat:cats, horse:horses, pig:pigs, rat:rats, wolf:wolves, monkey:monkeys strong:strongest, short:shortest, smart:smartest, weak:weakest, big:biggest, small:smallest pirate:piracy, robber:robbery, lobbyist:lobbying, scout:scouting, terrorist:terrorism, witch:witchcraft |

## Examples

| Category | Target | Nearest Neighbors ReIBERT |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Commonsense | barista:coffee <br> restaurant:waitress <br> car:garage <br> ice:melt <br> dolphin:swim <br> flower:fragrant <br> coconut:milk <br> bag:plastic <br> duck:duckling | baker:bread, brewer:beer, bartender:cocktail, winemaker:wine, bartender:drink, baker:cake restaurant:waiter, diner:waitress, bar:bartender, hospital:nurse, courthouse:clerk, office:clerk car:pit, plane:hangar, auto:garage, baby:crib, yacht:harbour, aircraft:hangar snow:melt, glacier:melt, ice:drift, crust:melt, polar ice:melt, ice:thaw squid:swim, salmon:swim, shark:swim, fish:swim, horse:run, frog:leap orchid:fragrant, cluster:fragrant, jewel:precious, jewel:valuable, soil:permeable, vegetation:abundant coconut:oil, goat:milk, grape:juice, palm:oil, olive:oil, camel:milk bottle:plastic, bag:leather, container:plastic, box:plastic, jug:glass, bottle:glass chicken:chick, pig:piglet, cat:kitten, ox:calf, butterfly:larvae, bear:cub |
| Gender | man:woman | men:women, male:female, father:mother, boy:girl, hero:heroine, king:queen |
| Antonymy | cooked:raw normal:abnorma | raw:cooked, regulated:unregulated, sober:drunk, loaded:unloaded, armed:unarmed, published:unpublished ordinary:unusual, usual:unusual, acceptable:unacceptable, stable:unstable, rational:irrational, legal:illegal |
| Meronymy | helicopter:rotor bat:wing beer:alcohol oxygen:atmosphere | helicopter:rotor blades, helicopter:wing, bicycle:wheel, motorcycle:wheel, airplane:engine, plane:engine butterfly:wing, eagle:wing, angel:wing, cat:paw, lion:wings, fly:wing wine:alcohol, cider:alcohol, soda:sugar, beer:liquor, beer:malt, lager:alcoho helium:atmosphere, hydrogen:atmosphere, nitrogen:atmosphere, methane:atmosphere, carbon:atmosphere |
| Hypernymy | chihuahua:dog pelican:bird tennis:sport | dachshund:dog, poodle:dog, terrier:dog, chinchilla:rodent, macaque:monkey, dalmatian:dog toucan:bird, puffin:bird, egret:bird, peacock:bird, grouse:bird, pigeon:bird <br> hockey:sport, soccer:sport, volleyball:sport, cricket:sport, golf:sport, football:sport |
| Morphology | dog:dogs tall:tallest spy:espionage | cat:cats, horse:horses, pig:pigs, rat:rats, wolf:wolves, monkey:monkeys strong:strongest, short:shortest, smart:smartest, weak:weakest, big:biggest, small:smallest pirate:piracy, robber:robbery, lobbyist:lobbying, scout:scouting, terrorist:terrorism, witch:witchcraft |

## Examples

| Category | Target | Nearest Neighbors RelBERT |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Commonsense | barista:coffee restaurant:waitress car:garage ice:melt dolphin:swim flower:fragrant coconut:milk bag:plastic duck:duckling | baker:bread, brewer:beer, bartender:cocktail, winemaker:wine, bartender:drink, baker:cake restaurant:waiter, diner:waitress, bar:bartender, hospital:nurse, courthouse:clerk, office:clerk car:pit, plane:hangar, auto:garage, baby:crib, yacht:harbour, aircraft:hangar snow:melt, glacier:melt, ice:drift, crust:melt, polar ice:melt, ice:thaw squid:swim, salmon:swim, shark:swim, fish:swim, horse:run, frog:leap orchid:fragrant, cluster:fragrant, jewel:precious, jewel:valuable, soil:permeable, vegetation:abundant coconut:oil, goat:milk, grape:juice, palm:oil, olive:oil, camel:milk bottle:plastic, bag:leather, container:plastic, box:plastic, jug:glass, bottle:glass chicken:chick, pig:piglet, cat:kitten, ox:calf, butterfly:larvae, bear:cub |
| Gender | man:woman | men:women, male:female, father:mother, boy:girl, hero:heroine, king:queen |
| Antonymy | cooked:raw <br> normal:abnormal | raw:cooked, regulated:unregulated, sober:drunk, loaded:unloaded, armed:unarmed, published:unpublished ordinary:unusual, usual:unusual, acceptable:unacceptable, stable:unstable, rational:irrational, legal:illegal |
| Meronymy | helicopter:rotor bat:wing beer:alcohol oxygen:atmosphere | helicopter:rotor blades, helicopter:wing, bicycle:wheel, motorcycle:wheel, airplane:engine, plane:engine butterfly:wing, eagle:wing, angel:wing, cat:paw, lion:wings, fly:wing wine:alcohol, cider:alcohol, soda:sugar, beer:liquor, beer:malt, lager:alcoho helium:atmosphere, hydrogen:atmosphere, nitrogen:atmosphere, methane:atmosphere, carbon:atmosphere |
| Hypernymy | chihuahua:dog pelican:bird tennis:sport | dachshund:dog, poodle:dog, terrier:dog, chinchilla:rodent, macaque:monkey, dalmatian:dog toucan:bird, puffin:bird, egret:bird, peacock:bird, grouse:bird, pigeon:bird hockey:sport, soccer:sport, volleyball:sport, cricket:sport, golf:sport, football:sport |
| Morphology | dog:dogs tall:tallest | cat:cats, horse:horses, pig:pigs, rat:rats, wolf:wolves, monkey:monkeys strong:strongest, short:shortest, smart:smartest, weak:weakest, big:biggest, small:smallest pirate:piracy, robber:robbery, lobbyist:lobbying, scout:scouting, terrorist:terrorism, witch:witchcraft |
|  | spy:espionage |  |

